



Tools4Inclusion

Systematic Literature Review

Tools4Inclusion

Partnership

Bagázs Közhasznú Egyesület – Hungary (coordinator)

Aproximar, Cooperativa de Solidariedade Social – Portugal

ELTE - Eötvös Loránd University – Hungary

Global Human Dignity – Malta / Human Dignity in Action - Belgium

Authorship

Eötvös Loránd Tudományegyetem (ELTE)

Date

August 2024

Funded by the European Union. Views and opinions expressed are however those of the author(s) only and do not necessarily reflect those of the European Union or the European Education and Culture Executive Agency (EACEA). Neither the European Union nor EACEA can be held responsible for them.

Overview

This report will briefly summarise the current state of a task that is associated with WP4. The purpose of the Systematic Literature Review is to provide methodological information for the WP2 Pilot Intervention. The aim is to give a comprehensive overview of existing interventions that use inclusive methods. The identified practices will be included in the Toolkit as an input.

Introduction

1. Background

The European Union Social Cohesion policy (European Commission, 2021) clearly states that social inclusion in European education is a priority, yet children from an ethnic minority or immigrant background still face social exclusion in partner countries of the European Union (Madanipour & Weck, 2015). In an environment where social inclusion is not promoted, peer victimization, peer-rejection and friendlessness emerge more easily (Juvonen et al., 2019). In addition, social exclusion and perceived prejudice not only have a negative impact on psychological well-being but can also affect academic achievement and progress in the school environment (Hood et al., 2017).

Educational settings play an important role in forming the intergroup orientations of children (Cooper & Slavin, 2001) and can potentially promote pro-social behaviour (Alan, 2021), thus supporting peers to be inclusive towards each other and overcome ethnic and cultural differences. Training of social skills can also be beneficial for children at risk of social exclusion as the promotion of these skills can result in higher levels of social interactions (Denham et al., 2007). The purpose of the study is to identify interventions that promote social inclusion of ethnic minority and immigrant children in formal and non-formal educational settings by shaping their intergroup relations and orientations of children as well as their social skills. Furthermore, our goal is to analyse the content of these intervention programmes with qualitative methods. Additionally, we would like to investigate the effectiveness of these programs where possible, by synthesising the quantitative results and analysing data with a meta-analytical approach. Based on the data collected, our aim is to collect all the reported interventions and best practices that are available in the current literature, furthermore we would like to identify the main characteristics of these interventions.

1.1 Primary research question

- ♦ **What type of interventions can be found promoting the social inclusion of immigrant/ethnic minority children in primary and secondary education? What are the methodological characteristics and contextual factors of feasibility of these intervention programs?**

1.2 Secondary research question

- ♦ **What are the common elements of these interventions and which elements can be associated with efficient and inefficient interventions?**

1.3 Method

We conducted a systematic search in three databases (PsychInfo, Web of Science, Scopus) in February 2024. The screening process was conducted in April ($n = 2565$). The assessment of eligibility and data extraction is in progress since April, a total number of 54 studies will be downloaded and the important data will be coded from the studies. Currently, 18 studies have been assessed and coded, meanwhile another 8 are in the coding process. We expect that the assessment and coding stage of the review will be conducted until the end of September.



Co-funded by
the European Union

Results

2. Results

2.1. Preliminary results

During the coding progress, 13 studies have been excluded (7 studies for not eligible age categories, 2 studies for not reporting on any intervention programs, 3 studies for irrelevant topic and 1 study for lack of measures). Five studies were eligible for the review, the details of these studies can be found in the method table.

Method Table

First author	Date of publication	Location	Age (years)	At risk	Minority status	Name of program	Program characteristics
Auh	2021	Gyeonggi province, Korea	n.d.	-	Participants from China, Vietnam, Thailand, USA, Philippines, Cambodia, Myanmar	Global Cultural Citizenship Education (GCCE)	The program aims to introduce multicultural topics to improve intercultural understanding and promote multicultural sensitivity for community relations development in response to rapid demographics changes in Korea.
Boucher	2021	Turkey, Europe	n.d.	-	Refugee children from Syria	Preschool Summer Camp Program	An early childhood program conducted in Turkey aimed at preparing 5-year-old native and Syrian refugee children for primary school and for the social integration of ethnic minority children.



Canabate	2021	Spain, Europe	4-8	-	Immigrant children	Cooperative Learning Techniques	During the program, teachers participated in a training about Sustainable Development Goals and cooperative learning techniques.
Isaac	2022	Los Angeles, USA	Age = 7	-	Latino children from immigrant descendents	Bridging Cultures Project	The Bridging Cultures Project engages Spanish-English bilingual elementary teachers in learning about individualistic values rooted in the design of instruction and behavioral management in U.S. classrooms and how they may differ from the relatively more collectivistic values of their students
Pirchio	2017	Italy, Europe	7-9	-	Caucasian, Asiatic, other ethnicities	School and Family together for the integration	The proposed narrative format is a group theater where the teacher and the children together preform a



of immigrant story. The story is performed
children (SOFT) using the target language
exclusively and the full range
of non-verbal communication
tools. The teacher is also part
of the playing group leading it
in the story plot, providing
the linguistic tools to express
it and bringing together the
children' attention and
involvement.

Discussion

3. Discussion

Based on the preliminary findings we can conclude that the included studies are eligible for writing a literature review. To conduct a meta-analysis, more studies using quantitative studies need to be identified.

All the identified studies were designed for the inclusion and integration of immigrant children. The studies used various methods for the support of inclusion. These methods were: instruction about multiculturalism, promotion of inter-ethnic friendships, instruction about cultural values, cooperative learning, and dramatic instruction. Each identified program takes place in an educational context, involving the teachers of the participating children. One of the programs further included the parents of the children.

In the next phase of the research, we will finalize the coding and conduct the quality appraisal of the included studies. Furthermore, we will analyse the content of the studies using a thematic analysis to answer the research questions.

3.1. Dissemination

The project has been submitted and presented at the Forum of Research Groups as an e-poster presentation with the following title: Perspectives and tools for social inclusion of ethnic minority children in a European context (available here: <https://www.ppk.elte.hu/content/kutatocsoportok-foruma-2024.e.14361>).

A written manuscript and research plan has been pre-registered on the Open Science Framework platform (available here: <https://osf.io/zhdcg/>).



**Co-funded by
the European Union**

2023-1-HU01-KA220-YOU-000161387

The European Commission support for the production of this publication does not constitute an endorsement of the contents which reflects the views only of the authors, and the Commission cannot be held responsible for any use which may be made of the information contained therein.



CC BY-NC-SA 4.0

This work is licensed under Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-ShareAlike 4.0 International. To view a copy of this license, visit <https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-sa/4.0/>